

CLARK HILL LLP

Bradford G. Hughes (SBN 247141)
bhughes@ClarkHill.com
Maryam Danishwar (SBN 259102)
mdanishwar@ClarkHill.com
555 South Flower Street, 24th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Telephone: (213) 891-9100
Facsimile: (213) 488-1178

Attorneys for Plaintiff DISCOVER NIGHT, LLC

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

DISCOVER NIGHT, LLC,

Plaintiff,

v.

SCAN GLOBAL LLC; TOTAL
QUALITY LOGISTICS; CARTAGE
TRANSPORT EXPRESS INC.; JOE
CINCOTTA AND DOES 1 THROUGH
50, INCLUSIVE,

Defendants.

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE
COMPANY,

Plaintiff,

v.

TRANSGROUP EXPRESS LLC d/b/a
SCAN GLOBAL LOGISTICS; TOTAL
QUALITY LOGISTICS, LLC;
CARTAGE TRANSPORT EXPRESS
INC.; B&E PROFESSIONAL
SERVICES LLC d/b/a KG LOGISTICS;
RITESH KUMAR d/b/a NS
TRANSPORT; and DOES 1 through 10,
Inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:23-cv-7268-CAS-JC *related
to Case No. 2:23-cv-09477-CAS-JC*

PROTECTIVE ORDER

Judge: Hon. Christina A. Snyder

Trial Date: NONE

Case No. 2:23-cv-09477-CAS-JC

1 A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 As the parties have represented that discovery in these actions is likely to
3 involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which
4 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
5 prosecuting this litigation may be warranted, this Court enters the following
6 Protective Order. This Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures
7 or responses to discovery. The protection it affords from public disclosure and use
8 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential
9 treatment under the applicable legal principles. Further, as set forth in Section 12.3,
10 below, this Protective Order does not entitle the parties to file confidential
11 information under seal. Rather, when the parties seek permission from the court to
12 file material under seal, the parties must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with
13 any pertinent orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge.

14 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

15 In light of the nature of the claims and allegations in this case and the parties'
16 representations that discovery in this case will involve the production of confidential
17 records, and in order to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
18 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately
19 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the
20 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in connection with
21 this action, to address their handling of such material at the end of the litigation, and
22 to serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this
23 matter. The parties shall not designate any information/documents as confidential
24 without a good faith belief that such information/documents have been maintained
25 in a confidential, non-public manner, and that there is good cause or a compelling
26 reason why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

27 ///

28 ///

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: The two related actions: *Discover Night, LLC v. Scan Global LLC et. al.* Case No.: 2:23-cv-7268-CAS-JC; and *Liberty Mutual Insurance Company v. Transgroup Express LLC et. al.* Case No.: 2:23-cv-09477-CAS-JC.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this Action.

///

1 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
2 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
3 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
4 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

5 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
6 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
7 support staffs).

8 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
9 Discovery Material in this Action.

10 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
11 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
12 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
13 and their employees and subcontractors.

14 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
15 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

16 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
17 from a Producing Party.

18 3. SCOPE

19 The protections conferred by this Order cover not only Protected Material (as
20 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected
21 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material;
22 and (3) any deposition testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their
23 Counsel that might reveal Protected Material, other than during a court hearing or at
24 trial.

25 Any use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial shall be
26 governed by the orders of the presiding judge. This Order does not govern the use
27 of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial.

28 ///

1 4. DURATION

2 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
3 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
4 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
5 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
6 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
7 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
8 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
9 pursuant to applicable law.

10 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

11 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

12 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
13 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
14 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
15 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
16 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items,
17 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably
18 within the ambit of this Order.

19 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
20 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
21 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
22 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
23 Party to sanctions.

24 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
25 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
26 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

27 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
28 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise

1 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
2 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
3 produced.

4 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

5 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
6 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions), that the Producing Party affix
7 at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL
8 legend”), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions
9 of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must
10 clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
11 margins).

12 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
13 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
14 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
15 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
16 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
17 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
18 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
19 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
20 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
21 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
22 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
23 markings in the margins).

24 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies
25 on the record, before the close of the deposition as protected testimony.

26 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
27 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
28 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
2 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
3 portion(s).

4 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
5 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
6 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
7 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
8 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
9 Order.

10 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

11 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
12 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
13 Scheduling Order.

14 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
15 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

16 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
17 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
18 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
19 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party
20 has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to
21 afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the
22 Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

23 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
25 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
26 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
27 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the

28 ///

1 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
2 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 13 below.

3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
4 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
5 authorized under this Order.

6 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
7 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
8 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
9 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

10 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well
11 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary
12 to disclose the information for this Action;

13 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
14 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

15 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
16 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
17 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (d) the court and its personnel;

19 (e) court reporters and their staff;

20 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
21 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
22 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
24 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

25 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
26 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
27 requests that the witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
28 form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any

1 confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
2 Be Bound” attached as Exhibit A, unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party
3 or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to
4 depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court
5 reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Protective
6 Order; and

7 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
8 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

9 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
10 IN OTHER LITIGATION

11 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
12 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
13 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

14 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
15 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order unless prohibited by law;

16 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
17 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
18 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
19 this Protective Order; and

20 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
21 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

22 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
23 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
24 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
25 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
26 permission, or unless otherwise required by the law or court order. The Designating
27 Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its
28 confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as

1 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful
2 directive from another court.

3 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
4 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

5 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
6 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
7 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
8 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
9 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

10 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
11 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
12 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
13 confidential information, then the Party shall:

14 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-
15 Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
16 agreement with a Non-Party;

17 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Protective
18 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
19 description of the information requested; and

20 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
21 Non-Party, if requested.

22 (c) If a Non-Party represented by counsel fails to commence the process
23 called for by Local Rules 45-1 and 37-1, et seq. within 14 days of receiving the
24 notice and accompanying information or fails contemporaneously to notify the
25 Receiving Party that it has done so, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-
26 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If an
27 unrepresented Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
28 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party

1 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
2 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
3 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
4 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court
5 unless otherwise required by the law or court order. Absent a court order to the
6 contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in
7 this court of its Protected Material.

8 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
10 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
11 Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the
12 Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve
13 all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons
14 to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d)
15 request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to
16 Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

17 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
18 PROTECTED MATERIAL

19 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
20 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
21 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
22 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
23 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
24 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
25 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
26 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
27 parties may incorporate their agreement into this Protective Order.

28 ///

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. No Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with any pertinent orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert

reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4.

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

Dated: August 9, 2024

CLARK HILL LLP

By: /s/ Bradford G. Hughes
Bradford G. Hughes
Maryam Danishwar
Attorneys for Plaintiff DISCOVER NIGHT,
LLC

Dated: August 9, 2024

WILES LAW, LLC

By: /s/ Matthew J. Wiles
Matthew J. Wiles
Attorneys for Defendant TOTAL QUALITY
LOGISTICS

Dated: August 9, 2024

WITHERS BERGMAN LLP

By: /s/ Conte C. Cicala
Conte C. Cicala
Chaya Weinberg-Brodt
Attorneys for Defendant TRANSGROUP
EXPRESS LLC d/b/a SCAN GLOBAL
LOGISTICS

1 Dated: August 9, 2024

GIBSON ROB & LINDH LLP

2
3 By: /s/ Joshua Kirsch

4 Joshua Kirsch
5 Attorneys for Plaintiff LIBERTY MUTUAL
INSURANCE COMPANY

6 IT IS SO ORDERED.

7
8 DATED: August 20, 2024

9
10 /s/ Jacqueline Chooljian
11 Honorable Jacqueline Chooljian
12 United States Magistrate Judge
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that
was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California
on August 20, 2024, in the two related cases of *Discover Night, LLC v. Scan Global
LLC et. al.* Case No.: 2:23-cv-7268-CAS-JC; and *Liberty Mutual Insurance
Company v. Transgroup Express LLC et. al.* Case No.: 2:23-cv-09477-CAS-JC. I
agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective
Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me
to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I
will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with
the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
_____ [print or type full address and
telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____